ADMINISTRATIVE CONTROL BOARD (ACB) – WASATCH FRONT WASTE AND RECYCLING DISTRICT (WFWRD) MONTHLY MEETING MINUTES

DATE/TIME	LOCATION	ATTENDEES
March 25, 2019 9:00 a.m.	Public Works Building	Board Members: Jim Brass, Brad Christopherson, Kay Dickerson, Dwight Marchant, Kris Nicholl, Sherrie Ohrn, Robert Paine, Brint Peel, Patrick Schaeffer Excused: Scott Bracken, Jim Bradley, Steve Gunn, Ron Patrick
Next Board Meeting April 22, 2019 9:00 a.m.	604 W 6960 S Midvale, UT 84047	<u>District Staff</u> : Anthony Adams, Craig Adams, Rachel Anderson, Rosemary Fasselin, David Ika, Yael Johnson, Paul Korth, Andrea Murdock, Pam Roberts
		Public: Greg Christensen, Melissa Kotter (On Track Solutions), Mike Reberg (Salt Lake County), Jenny Wilson (Salt Lake County), Keith Zuspan (Brighton)

AGENDA

Call to Order: Brint Peel, Board Chair

1. Consent Items:

1.1. February 25, 2019 Board Meeting Minutes (Motion & Approve)

2. Meeting Open for Public Comments: (Comments are limited to 3 minutes)

3. Business Items

- 3.1. Adopt Resolution 4389, Recognizing Retiring Board Member Jenny Wilson, Salt Lake County Mayor: Brint Peel; Pam Roberts, Executive Director (Motion & Approve)
- **3.2.** Continued Human Resources (HR) Consultant's Recommendations for the WFWRD Pay Plan: Andrea Murdock, HR Manager; Melissa Kotter, HR Consultant (Informational, Direction or Approval)
- 3.3. Process for Withdrawal of Sandy Annexed Properties in Granite: Rachel Anderson, Fabian VanCott (Informational/Direction)
- 3.4. Executive Director's Report: Pam Roberts (Informational/Direction)
 - 3.4.1. Status on the Negotiations with Salt Lake County for Landfill Services
 - 3.4.2. Second Letter to Sandy Residents in Granite

- 3.4.3. 2019 WFWRD Strategic Plan and Goals
- 3.4.4. 2018 Independent Financial Audit Status: Paul Korth, Controller

4. Closed Session (If Needed)

The Administrative Control Board may temporarily recess the meeting to convene in a closed session to discuss the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of an individual, pending or reasonable imminent litigation, and the purchase, exchange, or lease of real property, or other legally applicable reasons as provided by Utah Code Annotated §52-4-205.

5. Other Board Business

This time is set aside to allow Board members to share and discuss topics.

6. Requested Items for the Next Board Meeting(s)

- Executive Director and HR Consultant's Recommendations for Addressing Salary Compression Issues
- 2019 1st Quarter Financial Report
- 2019 1st Quarter Operations Performance Report

TOPICS/	KEY POINTS/	ACTION ITEMS	Cm - mys
OBJECTIVES	DECISIONS	WHO – WHAT – BY WHEN	STATUS
1.1 February 25, 2019 Board Meeting Minutes		Motion to Approve the Minutes by: Board Member Dickerson Seconded by: Board Member Nicholl Vote: All in favor (of Board Members present)	Approved March 25, 2019
2. Meeting Open for Public Comments	(Comments are limited to 3 minutes)		
	No public comments		
3. Business Items			
3.2. Continued HR Consultant's Recommendations for the WFWRD Pay Plan: Andrea Murdock, HR Manager; Melissa Kotter, HR Consultant (Informational, Direction, or Approval Requested)	Pam Roberts, Executive Director, introduced Melissa Kotter from On Track Solutions. Melissa has been WFWRD's HR Consultant since its organization, and has been instrumental in setting up our pay structures and compensation classifications. She has returned to help review our salary plan and make recommendations to help address the issues with our salary compression. Pam reminded the Board that they approved \$13,400 to fund adjustments to some positions' salaries in the pay plans that were inconsistent with others. Pam added that a few positions were below market for starting salary, and those positions have been adjusted as well. The main classification to address is Equipment Operator and getting them to a more marketable staring salary. The previous start range was \$17.51 per hour. This classification was moved from a 26% range to a consistent 40% range. It was also recommended that we move the starting salary, for Equipment Operator, to \$17.65 per hour. Melissa clarified that this new salary would bring		

Equipment Operators into the 25th percentile, which means 25% between the entry and the midpoint. While reviewing these updates, the movement of the Equipment Operator position caused inherent compression with the Lead Operator position's starting wage. Having the Lead Operator wage adjusted is being proposed for approval, which will also make that salary in the market range and the wage will match the position's responsibilities and it will be more valued.

Board Member Marchant asked what the average length of service was for Equipment Operators. Pam indicated that many of our Equipment Operators stay on and progress with promotions in their career. Their service years range from 10 to 20+ years currently.

Melissa described her qualifications and experience with Human Resources. She has been a consultant for WFWRD since its inception, and helped develop the pay structures and job reclassifications. She has recently been working with Pam and Andrea to address the inequalities in the pay structure due to compression in the pay scales. The newly adopted pay plan is established with a 50th percentile due to market and the 40% spread built around that percentile. However, this formula brings the starting wage for Equipment Operators too low for the current salary markets. As a result, it is recommended that Equipment Operators' starting salary begin at the 25th percentile, which is half-way between the minimum and midpoint of the pay range.

Board Member Paine asked if the average cost of labor, for these positions, is rising faster than we can keep up. Melissa did not have enough information to address this specifically, but Pam mentioned that we are competing with other transportation and construction companies during a nation-wide driver shortage. She added that although we just filled four driver vacancies, we still have six open. Melissa added that it is not just pay that keeps

employees, though it is a primary factor in getting them in the door.

Board Member Paine requested our turnover ratio. He added that we offer a great benefits package, but not a huge signing bonus like private companies do. How do we promote this and take it into consideration? Pam stated that we actively promote our benefits package to prospective applicants and new hires. Andrea added that our work hours are also appealing to our drivers. Pam stated that proper training is essential since driving a garbage truck is very unique. Andrea indicated that she can come back with firm numbers to reflect our turnover ratio, but does not have them immediately available. Pam mentioned that we have already had 10 vacancies so far this year.

Andrea added that adjustments should be made to the Lead Equipment Operator position, since this is the logical next step for an Equipment Operator and this should be appealing for our employees to have the opportunity for promotion and to advance. Melissa clarified that there is currently only a 14%-15% difference at the midpoint between Equipment Operator and Lead Equipment Operator. Without adjusting the Lead's salary range, we are restricting the ability for career growth.

Board Chair Peel asked how we will fund this proposal. Pam explained that the 2019 budget for tipping fees at the Landfill or Transfer Station was \$32.85 per ton. At the end of last year, the Salt Lake County Council implemented a tiered fee structure at the Landfill where the more tonnage that is committed to be delivered to the Landfill by a disposal company, the better rate they would receive.

We have committed 10,001-20,000 tons for 2019 at \$28.50 per ton. We could easily fulfill that commitment with the tonnages from Magna and Kearns. This will also maintain efficiencies for mileage and fuel, but there is a

Andrea will obtain WFWRD's current turnover ratio in regards to employment.

loss of time convenience due to wait times and in/out times at the Landfill. However, the Landfill is investing in their infrastructure to address this concern.

David Ika, Operations Manager, stated that we have already reached the 10,000 ton threshold. There is also funding in the 2019 personnel budget, due to employee turnover and vacant positions that can be used in 2019.

Additionally, we have an option to use the Ace Intermountain Recycling Transfer Station for Municipal Solid Waste (MSW) with a small savings in tipping fees. It may not be a large savings and we are going to test and explore our options with this venue in April with eight of our Thursday Taylorsville routes.

Board Member Brass asked about training protocols, and if new drivers are teamed with an experienced driver. Pam confirmed that this is part of our training, which also includes in-office training, map reading/routing and truck operations with a Lead or Supervisor.

David added that new drivers team up with a driver on route for about a week. Board Member Brass commented on the expense of training and the importance on keeping the drivers we train rather than training for other organizations. We really need to work so that we stop losing drivers. Pam confirmed it costs the organization around \$10,000 per employee turnover, including recruitment, training costs, and benefit enrollment. Board Member Brass added that we should fix this wage gap before it becomes a larger concern and challenge. We need to obtain and keep good people.

Paul Korth, District Controller, stated that we don't want to plan to use budgeted wages (as a result of vacant positions) for long-term fixes because those funds aren't guaranteed, but not fixing the wage gap could be self-feeding and continue to prevent obtaining the staff we

		need. However, we do have some capacity in this year's budget to fund the proposed pay adjustments. Board Chair Peel stated that we need to make this change to be competitive in the workforce. It will not hurt our bottom line this year, but we need to ensure this increase is budgeted in future years. Board Member Ohrn commended staff on their work to find options and solutions.	Motion to Approve the Recommendations by WFWRD's HR Consultant: Board Vice Chair Christopherson Seconded by: Board Member Brass Vote: All in favor (of Board Members present)	Approved March 25, 2019
3.1.	Adopt Resolution 4389, Recognizing Board Member Jenny Wilson, Salt Lake County Mayor: Brint Peel & Pam Roberts, Executive Director (Motion & Approve)	Pam thanked Mayor Wilson for her support and service on the Administrative Control Board. Mayor Wilson announced that she has adjusted the structure of the Salt Lake County Mayor's Office. There are changes that will affect this Board. The restructure is intended to streamline processes and combine functions that are more logical. She has a team that will address regional operations, including Landfill and Solid Waste. Mike Reberg is the Associate Director and will report to Deputy Mayor Catherine Kanter, who will take over for Rick Graham. One of the reasons for this restructuring is due to a decrease in municipal area within the County, increasing the importance of the County's regional role to all the cities and townships. Mayor Wilson also announced that the County will be recruiting for an Executive Director over Solid Waste. The individual in this role will address some of the complexities of the issues faced with the Transfer Station and its operations, and establish a long-term plan for the facility. Her service on this Board helped her understand the importance of this position and the related issues. Board Chair Peel read the resolution recognizing Mayor Wilson's service on the ACB.	Motion to Adopt Resolution 4389: Board Member Brass Seconded by: Board Member Paine Vote: All in favor (of Board Members present)	Approved March 25, 2019

3.3	Process for Withdrawal of Sandy
	Annexed Properties in Granite:
	Rachel Anderson, Fabian VanCot
	(Informational/Direction)

Rachel reviewed the process that was required for legal withdrawal of properties from the District. Pam clarified that there are around 1,000 homes effecting Granite, Sandy Hills, Willow Creek, and other surrounding areas. This process of withdrawing Granite residences may prompt other District residences to also withdraw since they are residents of Sandy City.

Rachel explained that the Salt Lake County Council must make the acting decision by resolution since WFWRD is a Special Service District and not a Local District. The process before the resolution includes a local final entity plat detailing which areas will be removed; and within 30 days after the resolution to withdraw, the County must submit a Notice of Impending Boundary Action to the Lieutenant Governor's Office. Within 10 days of the Lieutenant Governor's Office receiving this notice, they are to return a Certificate of Withdrawal.

The County then files all the documentation with the County Recorder. She pointed out that if a District has outstanding bonds or other debts, the process is not as streamlined, but WFWRD does not have any outstanding bonds or debts to complicate the process.

Board Chair Peel asked where we are in this process. Pam answered that the next step would be for her to request time on the County Council's agenda for them to start the process and begin involving their surveyor to create the required plat. She will reach out to their chair, Richard Snelgrove, his senior advisor, and also Board Member Bradley to assist in getting this on their agenda. Rachel stated that with an effective date of July 1, we will want to wait until we get closer since there are some strict deadlines once the process starts. She added that it doesn't matter too much if this goes into effect a few days before or after July 1st. She commented that the process isn't complicated, but can be time consuming at certain stages. We can get the plat prepared at any time. Board Chair

Pam will request that this topic be on an upcoming County Council Meeting for discussion and future action.

		Peel recommended that we get the plat ordered soon and have it ready. He further asked which entity initiates this plat request. Rachel clarified that the request needs to come from the creating entity of the District, which is the County Council. Pam stated that a representative from Sandy City, Paul Browning, has stated that he will attend the County Council meeting with her and it will be a joint effort. She added that the Granite residents have been kept apprised, and a second letter to them was sent out last week. Board Member Dickerson stated that we should move forward and get things moving.
3.4	Executive Director's Report; Pam Roberts (Informational)	
3.4.1	Status on the Negotiations with Salt Lake County for Landfill Services	Pam reviewed that negotiations with Salt Lake County for Landfill Services is focused on reducing the required minimum amount of waste delivered to County facilities. It is currently at 85%. She emphasized that it makes sense to take the majority of our waste to County facilities, but WFWRD is interested in reducing this required minimum amount to allow for potentially greater efficiencies. Negotiations have been delayed, but County representatives have indicated that these negotiations will be a priority.
3.4.2	Second Letter to Sandy Residents in Granite	This topic was addressed earlier, that letters to Sandy residents in Granite went out last week. Additional letters will go out to keep Sandy and Granite residents informed.
3.4.3	2019 WFWRD Strategic Plan and Goals	Pam stated that the Board Packet includes a detailed Strategic Plan created by WFWRD's Leadership Team. The document includes red lines and edits because this is a living document that is updated and refined as we go.

This is being shared with the Board because Board members are a very important part of the team. The Board establishes policy and then that is taken to the Administrative and Operations Teams to implement efficiencies, customer satisfaction, and safety. Pam added that she views Board members as invested stakeholders, and she encouraged any comments and suggestions on how to improve.

Our Leadership Team has been working with our consultant, Pam Gardiol, to establish these goals and develop leadership strengths. She restated her gratitude for the Board's support and approval of the compensation package, which will help in keeping employees engaged and feel valued.

She shared an example of involving Lead Equipment Operators in developing a training program due to flaws in the old system. We have very talented and dedicated employees. We have four new employees, and this is the first opportunity to test out our new training program.

Board Member Marchant thanked WFWRD for the Area Cleanup Program and asked how the collection dates were determined. Pam explained that everyone wants this program in the spring and fall. She and Rosemary Fasselin, WFWRD Geographic Information Systems (GIS) Route Coordinator, clarified that we have a five-year clockwise rotation with the starting locations. Last year we started in Herriman.

This year is the last year in the new established rotation, so a new rotation plan will need to be established for next year. Pam clarified that the original plan of the program was to always start where it was most efficient, which started in Herriman every spring, but communities were unsatisfied with their dates, so the Board adopted a rotation schedule so that all areas can get a spring and fall cleanup within the five-year rotation schedule.

Area Cleanup Maps and Schedules will be brought for Board review at the next meeting.

	TT 1 4	T	
	The reason Herriman was the most efficient is because our		
	containers were stored at Welby Pit in South Jordan,		
	which is close to Herriman. We will need to find a new		
	location for our container storage at the end of this season.		
	Board Chair Peel asked about other storage options. Pam		
	stated we have a couple of options that are being explored		
	in far north or West Jordan.		
	Board Chair Peel stated that it would be interesting to see		
	if the communities would rather have a consistent date		
	rather than a rotation. Board Member Marchant stated that		
	a rotation was a fair procedure. Board Member Dickerson		
	added that as long as residents are informed of the date,		
	the rotation works. Board Member Marchant confirmed		
	that residents receive a postcard indicating the date of		
	collection and additional instructions.		
	Consession and additional most actions.		
	Board Member Ohrn indicated that Herriman supplements		
	with their own city collection program in a different		
	season from the WFWRD program. Pam reported that		
	Herriman's Public Works Department provides that		
	service to Herriman residents. They have containers		
	similar to WFWRD and drop them off in centralized		
	locations.		
2.4.4.2010.1.1.1.4.5	D 1 1.1 . 1 2010 : 1 1 . 6" : 1 1'.		
	Paul announced that the 2018 independent financial audit,		
Paul Korth, District Controller	by the Certified Public Accounting firm: Gilbert &		
	Stewart, is in progress. Ron Stewart and his team were		
	here for a couple of days in February. Ron Stewart		
	requested that the presentation to the Board be		
	rescheduled to May. Paul indicated that we have good		
	controls in place at WFWRD, and there are no anticipated		
	issues, but it is a good time for us to look at things		
	internally. He also confirmed that this is the first year we		
	have worked with Gilbert & Stewart.		
4. Closed Session			
	No Closed Session		
	The Crosed Session		

5. Other Board Business			
	No Other Board Business Discussed		
6. Requested Items for the Next Board Meeting			
	Area Cleanup Operations Overview		
	• 2019 1st Quarter Financial Report		
	2019 1 st Quarter Operations Performance Report		
ADJOURN		Motion to Adjourn: Board Vice Chair Christopherson Seconded by Board Member Nicholl	Approved March 25, 2019
		Vote: All in favor (of Board Members present)	